

# Deliberation on The Jaladuta Prayers

By Syamarani dasi  
Edited by Vaijayanti-mala dasi

## Introduction

I have been repeatedly requested by some senior Vaisnavas to write an article in response to some recent posts and papers issued by leaders of the Krsna-Balarama Mandira in Seva Kunja. Because I am so late, several sincere devotees have already written excellent statements and have given wonderful quotes regarding many of the points I will be covering; but still I am writing.

In a nutshell, the papers, statements, and posts from the Krsna-Balarama Mandira say that our diksa-guru, Srila Prabhupada Bhaktivedanta Svami Maharaja, is in sakhya-rasa, and that the twenty years of intense preaching, along with the publishing of the book Gaura-vani Pracarine, by our siksa-guru, Srila Gurudeva, Srila Bhaktivedanta Narayana Gosvami Maharaja, was “a preaching tactic” compared to “bait to catch fish.” They say his 20 years of preaching was a type of benevolent cheating, so to speak, for the benefit of our Prabhupada’s followers and disciples, in order to draw them into Mahaprabhu’s mission.

This article will be presented in two parts. Part One concerns Srila Prabhupada’s prayer aboard the Jaladuta Steamship. Part Two, sent shortly afterward, is a transcription of Srila Bhakti Vijnana Bharati Maharaja’s response to Krsna-Balarama Mandira’s claim that he supports their idea. His response was spoken yesterday, March 23rd, at Sri Caitanya Gaudiya Matha in Pahar Ganj, Delhi.

## Part One – Srila Prabhupada’s Jaladuta Poem

In order to substantiate their statements, the Krsna-Balarama Mandira presents their translation of two verses from Prabhupada’s Jaladuta prayer, the poem that he wrote on the steamship that brought him in 1965 to America, to Commonwealth Pier. We present their translation below, as well as the translation given by the GVP sevakas (which is very similar to the BBT translation). Below that, we include what Srila Gurudeva has personally said in reference to this Jaladuta poetry.

### Translation of Verses 8 and 9 from Krsna-Balarama Mandira

Verse 8: Tumi mor cira sathi – O Krsna You are my friend forever. Forgetting this friendship maya has been kicking me birth after birth. Aji punah e sujoga – If today I could get the same chance then I would meet with You. When we meet the same happiness will come.

Verse 9: Tomara milane bhai – O my dear Brother! I will go cow-grazing with You from morning to evening. All day long I will run behind You from forest to forest. I will forcibly steal your lunch and eat it, and you will forcibly steal my lunch and eat it. O when will that day be mine?”

### **Translation of verses 1, 8 and 9 of the Jaladuta poem by GVP sevakas**

[We are also including the translation of verse 1, which sets the mood of the entire prayer:]

Verse 1:

krsna taba punya habe bhai  
e-punya koribe jabe radharani khushi habe  
dhruva ati boli toma tai

“O brother, Krsna, You shall obtain Your good fortune – Srimati Radharani will be pleased with You – when You perform this supremely virtuous act [which I will now convey]. This I declare to You with utter conviction.”

Here, it is apparent that Srila Prabhupada, the embodiment of rupanuga, is telling Krsna that if He will assist him in establishing Caitanya Mahaprabhu’s mission (anarpita carim cirat), then Srimati Radharani will be pleased with Him.

Verse 8:

tumi mor cira sathi bhuliya mayar lathi  
khaiyachi janma-janmantare  
aji punah e sujoga jadi hoy jogayoga  
tabe pari tuhe milibare

“You are my eternal companion. Having forgotten You, I have suffered the kick of *maya*, lifetime after lifetime. If today the chance for communion with You again occurs, then I will be able to meet with You.”

Verse 9:

tomara milane bhai abar se sukha pai  
gocarane ghuri din bhor  
kata bane chutachuti bane khai lutaputi  
sei din kabe habe mor

“In Your company, dear friend, I will experience that same joy once again. I will wander all day long, tending the cows. I will run throughout the many forests and roll on the ground. Oh, when will that day be mine?”

We personally accept the GVP sevakas' translation. But whether one accepts the Krsna-Balarama Mandira translation, or the GVP sevakas' translation, or the BBT translation, none of the translations are evidence of Prabhupada's svarupa. Even if the Krsna-Balarama Mandira translation is considered correct, it is not evidence at all that Srila Prabhupada is in sakhya-rasa – as can be seen in the quotes below.

Srila Gurudeva has explained that because all other rasas are included within madhura-rasa, sometimes our Prabhupada and our other previous acaryas write their prayers in such a way that their prayers include the moods of the lower rasas.

For example, in verse 24 of Utkalika-vallari, Srila Rupa Gosvami, who is Sri Rupa Manjari in his gopi form, prays to Subala for mercy:

“O Subala, in Vraja-mandala you are a priya-narma sakha, bosom friend of Sri Nanda Maharaja's son and Sri Vrsabhanu Maharaja's daughter. On this day, extend but a slight gesture of mercy to me and relate my sad story to your two friends.”

Srila Gurudeva has explained in this connection, “Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura wrote many kinds of poetries. Sometimes he seemed to be in the mood of a son, sometimes he wrote in dasya-rasa, sakhya-rasa, or vatsalya-rasa, but actually he was Kamala Manjari.” Srila Bharati Maharaja has given a specific example of this: Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura's prayer, Saranagati (Fourth Principle of Surrender: 'Avasya Raksibe Krsna' – Visvasa Palana – Faith in Krsna as Protector) Song 3. Verse 9 is particularly interesting:

“When You lead Your herds to pasture, O Madhava, on the banks of the Yamuna river, You will call to them by softly playing on Your flute.” (3)

“By slaying great demons such as Aghasura and Bakasura You will always provide full protection, O Kan of the cowherd settlement!” (4)

“Fearless and confident of Your protection, I will drink the water of the Yamuna.” (5)

“The Kaliya serpent's venom poisoned the Yamuna's waters, yet that poison will be vanquished. You will purify the Yamuna, and by such heroic deeds enhance our faith.” (6)

“You will surely protect me by swallowing the forest fire. Thus You are called Gopala (protector of the cows) and Govinda (pleaser of the cows).” (7)

“In order to curb the malice of Indra, king of the demigods, You will protect me from his torrents of rain, O lifter of the mighty Govardhana Hill!” (8)

“When the four-headed Brahma abducts me along with Your cowherd boyfriends and calves, then also You will surely protect me, O Gokula Hari!” (9)

[As already posted by Tirthapada Prabhu] In Verse 6 of Sri Vraja-vilasa Stava, Srila Raghunatha dasa Gosvamipada, who is well-known as Rati or Tulasi-manjari in his gopi form, prays:

"I accept the shelter of the pasturing fields of Vraja, where even Sri Madhava and His brother, Balarama, and their dearest friends are playing in pastimes of herding the cows with great love, whose unprecedented sweetness is manifest in the hearts of the rasika bhaktas, and which is dearer to Sri Hari than Mathura-puri."

## **Srila Gurudeva's Comments on the Jaladuta Poem**

The Krsna-Balarama Mandira's posts and papers say that the Jaladuta poem is evidence that Prabhupada is a sakha. This idea was brought to Srila Gurudeva's attention several times. He can read Bengali – no need for any translation – and he dismissed it as non-evidential of Prabhupada being in sakya-rasa. It is stated in Gurudeva's book, *My Siksa-guru and Priya-bandhu*, Chapter Two:

"Srila Svami Maharaja was surely in madhurya-rasa. Some may say, why not sakhya-rasa? I am not denying this, because in madhurya-rasa everything is there. In madhurya-rasa, all other rasas – vatsalya-rasa, sakhya-rasa, everything – is included there. So it may be said that all rasas were in him; he was not deprived of sakhya-rasa.

"He had written some things in his poems, and he had special affection for Gaura-Nitai and Krsna-Balarama; we know that. But Swamiji was certainly in madhurya-rasa.

"His sannyasa-guru, my Gurudeva, gave him the sannyasa-mantra, the gopi-bhava-mantra, in our Rupanuga line. Just like Srila Rupa Gosvami, Srila Jiva Gosvami, Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura, and his gurudeva, and just as he wrote in his realizations in the purports of his books, he was surely in madhurya-rasa."

The Krsna-Balarama Mandira's posts say that Prabhupada, as a priya-narma sakha (the most intimate of Krsna's cowherd friends) can also serve Radha-Krsna in the kunjās. Srila Gurudeva disagrees with this. He often referred to Srila Prabhupada's beautiful daily singing of "Jaya Radha-Madhava Kunja-bihari." In this excerpt from May 29, 1999, he relates Prabhupada's singing of this song to the Jaladuta poem:

"Someone has the idea that Swamiji was only of friend rasa [friendship rasa]; that he was like a friend. But a friend cannot glorify Krsna with the words 'Jaya kunja-bihari.' Can he do so? He has no right to this. "Jaya radha-madhava, jaya kunja-bihari;" especially this. Those in friendship rasa they cannot sing in this way. So I told that actually he, Swamiji, was not a friend, in friendship rasa.

He can make any poetry like this, sometimes. Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura wrote many kinds of poetries. Sometimes he seemed to be in the mood of a son,

sometimes he wrote in dasya-rasa, sakhya-rasa, or vatsalya-rasa, but actually he was Kamala-manjari.

So Swamiji has made some poetry in a special case, for a special thing, like friendship rasa. But how can he glorify Krsna with the words “Jaya kunjabi-hari” if he’s in only in friendship rasa?

Srila Gurudeva explained on Balarama's appearance day in 1992 that [even if it is accepted that verse 9 of the Jaladuta prayer shows some affinity for sakhya-rasa,] it is all right, since sakhya-rasa is included within madhura-rasa:

"God was so much pleased. He could not live without Swamiji, so He called him home. He wanted that in this stage he should only preach vaidhibhakti, so he preached only as Sanatana Gosvami had done.

“But he has written in Sri Caitanya-caritamṛta, in explanation of the dialogue between Raya Ramananda and Caitanya Mahāprabhu, “Gopi vina aie bhava naie asvardhana – only gopis, creepers, leaves and manjaris of Radhika, they can realize these kunjaseva pastimes of Krsna. Being without gopi-bhava, neither Laksmi, Sankara, Brahma, or even Uddhava, could taste all these things.

“So Srila Svami Maharaja was given this mantra by his gurudeva, and he has given all these mantras to you; so don't think that he was in sakhya-rasa. A madhurya-rasa guru can give santa, dasya, sakhya, vatsalya, and madhurya. He will give this bhava exclusively to those who are qualified, otherwise he will give only santa, dasya, sakhya, and vatsalya. So, if he has written in what appeared to be sakhya-bhava anywhere, it is all right.”

A sannyasa disciple of Srila Gurudeva and member of the Krsna-Balarama Mandira stated in his posting: “We all originally accepted Srila Prabhupada as being in sakhya-rasa on the basis of his Jaladuta poetry, until our faith in Srila Gurudeva (and some in Srila Gour Govinda Maharaja) cancelled that understanding. Due to that faith, we turned blind to that evidence where Srila Prabhupada undeniably revealed himself.”

In other words, they are saying that Gurudeva blinded us to the truth about Prabhupada.

## **Srila Prabhupada Hid Himself from the Unqualified**

When Srila Prabhupada came to the West, he came to a land where people were barely on the human platform. He had much to do to make everyone more qualified for bhakti. As Srila Gurudeva often said, “Srila Svami Maharaja had to cut so many jungles.” He had to establish varnasrama dharma and defeat atheism and impersonalism. He had to establish the teachings of Bhagavad-gita and the first nine cantos of Srimad-Bhagavatam, such as how the material manifestation was created by Krsna in the form of His three Visnu incarnations. He had to establish a marriage system to counteract the widespread promiscuity. He had to create

auspiciousness for a most degraded population through the transcendental festival of Ratha-yatra. He had to first teach his students to put on their tilaka by using water, not their saliva. And he had to teach them when to use the left hand and when to use the right. I was there from the beginning. I was one of those human animals.

He had to get such animalistic humans to chant at least sixteen rounds, follow the four regulative principles, and distribute his books all over the world. In other words, he had to prepare us for gradual further advancement, when we would be able to hear and understand further.

So it is not as the Krsna-Balarama Mandira leaders claim – that Srila Gurudeva was benevolently cheating Prabhupada’s disciples. Rather, Prabhupada himself had been benevolently ‘cheating’ us of the real information about his identity – for our welfare. If he had directly told us that he is a 12 ½ year old manjari, who gets kiss-marks on her own lips when Krsna kisses Srimati Radhika – his thousands of unqualified followers could well have become sahajiya. Havoc could have reigned in his budding worldwide society.

## “Your Prabhupada Has Cheated Them All”

Srila Prabhupada came to America in 1965, and I met and joined him in 1966. Over thirty-five years later, Srila Gurudeva explained in his vyasa-puja address in Murwillumbah, Australia (February 2, 2002) that Prabhupada had hidden his real identity from us:

**Srila Gurudeva:** “Srila Bhaktivedanta Svami Maharaja and my Gurudeva are both serving there in their female forms as gopis. In that realm my Gurudeva is Vinoda Manjari, Srila Prabhupada Bhaktisiddanta Sarasvati Thakura is Nayana Manjari, Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura is Kamala Manjari, Srila Jiva Gosvami is Vilasa Manjari, Srila Rupa Gosvami is Rupa Manjari, and Srila Raghunatha dasa Gosvami is Rati Manjari. These manjaris can serve Radha-Krsna Conjugal.”

**Dhrstadyumna dasa:** And our Srila Prabhupada?

**Srila Gurudeva:** If you fully surrender, by body, mind, words and ego, then I may tell you. Otherwise, I will not. I know who he is, but you do not know. None of the ISKCON leaders know. Your Prabhupada has cheated them all, in the sense that he has not revealed himself to them at all. He is rati-keli-siddhyai ya yalibhir yuktir apeksaniya.

Srila Gurudeva writes in his commentary to Venu-gita, verse 16: “The word gopi originates from gupta, meaning ‘to keep hidden.’ One who can keep her affection for Krsna concealed in her heart is a gopi.”

## **Sukadeva Gosvami Also Hid His Heart**

It is not unusual that the associates of Krsna hide their hearts from the unqualified. Srila Sukadeva Gosvami is Srimati Radhika's parrot, but he did not reveal that. He did not even mention Radharani's name once in the entire Srimad-Bhagavatam. But Srila Gurudeva has revealed that Radharani's presence is there in every sloka. (I mention this because the Krsna-Balarama Mandira leaders state that Prabhupada did not once mention the term 'Radha-dasyam' in his books.\*)

Indeed the meanings and moods of the slokas in all twelve cantos, were hidden. It took our acaryas, such as Srila Sanatana Gosvami, Srila Jiva Gosvami, and Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura, to unlock the doors to a deep understanding.

[\*It may be noted in his books Prabhupada used English equivalents for terms such as Radha-dasyam and manjari etc.]

## **Srila Gurudeva's Conviction**

In a paper containing the Krsna-Balarama Mandira translation of the Jaladuta prayer, the author writes: "When Bhaktivedanta Swami Maharaja Srila Prabhupada was present on this planet, everyone accepted that he was in sakhya-rasa, as he told this himself both directly and indirectly."

This is not entirely true. I was there, travelling throughout the ISKCON world. Many ISKCON members didn't give his rasa a moment's thought. Some had never even heard of such a conception. For those of us, like myself, who did think that he was a cowherd boy, it was not something we thought about deeply. Most of us were only absorbed in the happiness of serving his form in this world.

However, it may be noted that the disciples of Prabhupada who are still propagating this idea, and from whom Krsna-Balarama Mandira members have been quoting in their official statements, are openly in disagreement with Srila Gurudeva and are critical of Gurudeva's words and convictions. In his response to a letter from Tripurari Maharaja, who tried to convince him of Prabhupada being in sakhya-rasa, Srila Gurudeva wrote:

"So, I know him and I have a strong belief that he is in gopi-bhava, following the mood of Sri Rupa Manjari. You will not be able to change my conviction and I request that you will not try to do this" (letter to Tripurari Maharaja (May 15, 2009))

## **A Sakha Cannot be Rupanuga**

On many occasions, Srila Prabhupada referred to himself and his mission as being rupanuga. For example:

“Narottama dasa Thakura says that, ‘These six Gosvamis, anyone who accepts these six Gosvamis as authority, spiritual masters, I am his servant.’ Therefore we Gaudiya Vaisnavas, we are known as Rupanuga Vaisnava, following the footsteps of Srila Rupa Gosvami.” (November 6, 1972)

“We Gaudiya Vaisnava, we are known as rupanuga. Rupanuga means the followers of Rupa Gosvami. So why we should become followers of Rupa Gosvami? Because Sri-caitanya-mano ' bhistham sthapitam yena bhu-tale. He wanted to establish the mission of Sri Caitanya Mahaprabhu. Mano bhistham. Sri Caitanya, mano 'bhistham, Sri Caitanya Mahaprabhu, the same thing. This is called disciplic succession.” (April 13, 1975)

However, we did not understand the depth of what that really meant; Prabhupada’s mood and meaning was hidden from us unqualified disciples. It took Gurudeva to reveal this mood to us; so now when we hear from Prabhupada about Rupanuga or read about it in his books, by Srila Gurudeva’s mercy everything is crystal clear. Srila Gurudeva writes:

“All the inhabitants of Vraja – including the gopas, gopis, cows, calves, animals and birds – are ragatmika. Sadhakas who follow the moods of these inhabitants of Vraja in order to attain their bhava are called raganuga. Amongst these raganuga sadhakas, only those who specifically follow the internal mood of Sri Rupa-manjari are rupanuga. Thus, every rupanuga sadhaka is also a raganuga-sadhaka, but raganuga sadhakas are not necessarily rupanuga. Rupanuga sadhakas are those who with the external body follow the process of bhajana as shown by Srila Rupa Gosvami, and simultaneously with their internally conceived spiritual body (siddha-deha) follow the moods of Sri Rupa Manjari as she eternally serves Sri Radha-Krsna in Vraja. Only that sort of raganuga sadhaka is called a rupanuga Vaisnava.” (Acarya Kesari Sri Srimad Bhakti Prajnana Kesava Gosvami, His Life and Teachings, seventh part.)

The official statement from Krsna-Balarama Mandir has presented what we consider a different understanding of rupanuga from Srila Gurudeva. Their leaders wrote: “Our paramaradhyatama Srila Gurudeva, Srila Bhaktivedanta Narayana Gosvami Maharaja said Srila Swami Maharaja’s glory is that he is a Rupanuga Vaisnava, and that is certainly true. Whichever bhava any of our acaryas has, he had to take from Srila Rupa Gosvami’s moods and ideas, for any rasa. Therefore all acaryas in our parampara are called Rupanuga, although each one will not cross beyond the area of his own rasa; all follow Srila Rupa Gosvami, but there is some special part or department that not all touch.”

Gurudeva’s actual words tell us what Rupanuga is NOT:

“If anyone has the mood of Yasoda Maiya, if anyone has the mood of friends, like Subala and Sridama, or if they have any mood of Lalita, Visakha, Citra, the asta-sakhis, they are not Rupanuga – they are raganuga.” (Essence of all Advice, chapter 11)

“Those who follow Srila Rupa Gosvami’s Bhakti-rasamrta-sindhu under the guidance of the sakhas, like Subala, Sridama and all others like them, desiring to serve Lord Krsna like them, will also not be called rupanuga. They will be called raganuga.” (Oct 12, 1996, Varsana, Disappearance day of Srila Prabhupada)